



JENNIFER M. GRANHOLM
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MICHIGAN
DEPARTMENT OF TREASURY
LANSING

ROBERT J. KLEINE
STATE TREASURER

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE STATE TAX COMMISSION

***Lansing Center, Meeting Room 201
333 East Michigan Avenue, Lansing, Michigan***

***August 19, 2008
9:00 a.m.***

***PRESENT: Robert H. Naftaly, Chair STC
Douglas B. Roberts, Member STC
Frederick W. Morgan, Member STC

Kelli Sobel, Executive Secretary
LaNiece Densteadt, Recording Secretary***

The item numbers referred to in the minutes correspond to the agenda items as numbered.

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the minutes of June 12, 2008, as presented. (Item 1 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt Executive Secretary Sobel's recommendation to assume jurisdiction of the 2008 assessment roll for New Buffalo Township, Berrien County, order the Township to hire an outside party to correct the problems noted in the roll by November 1, 2008, and also notify the Commission when the outside party is hired. The Commission also asked that Field Staff monitor the work to ensure timelines are met. (Item 2 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to accept Emerson Township, Gratiot County plan to complete their reappraisal by October 1, 2008 and will automatically issue an order to assume jurisdiction of the 2008 assessment roll if not complete by the deadline. The Commission also asked that Field Staff monitor and evaluate their progress. (Item 3 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to accept Homer Township, Midland County plan to complete their reappraisal by November 1, 2008 and will automatically issue an order to assume jurisdiction of the 2008 assessment roll if not complete by the deadline. The Commission also asked that Field Staff monitor and evaluate their progress. (Item 4 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to accept the City of Algonac, St. Clair County plan to hire the County to assess and conduct a complete reappraisal by the 2010 assessment roll and to formally notify in writing of the Board's approved contract. (Item 5 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt Executive Secretary Sobel's recommendation to assume jurisdiction of the 2008 assessment roll for Branch Township, Mason County, order the Township to hire an outside party to conduct a complete reappraisal by November 1, 2009, notify the Commission when the outside party is hired and report monthly on their progress. (Item 6 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the order to return jurisdiction of the 2007 roll to Freeman Township, Clare County. (Item 7 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the order to return jurisdiction of the 2007 roll to Antioch Township, Wexford County. (Item 8 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the order to return jurisdiction of the 2006 roll to Holmes Township, Menominee County. (Item 9 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the order to return jurisdiction of the 2007 roll to Liberty Township, Wexford County. (Item 10 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the order to return jurisdiction of the 2007 roll to Wexford Township, Wexford County. (Item 11 on agenda)

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Morgan, and unanimously approved adopt the order to certify the 2007 roll for Greenbush Township, Alcona County. (Item 12 on agenda)

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Morgan, and unanimously approved to adopt the recommendations of the hearings group for classification appeals. (Item 13 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Morgan, and unanimously approved to release for comment a document prepared by Tim Schnelle, of the Assessment and Certification Division on classification. ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to form a committee to develop a review equivalent to the 14-point review for County Equalization Departments. (Item 14 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to issue Bulletin 5 of 2008, Certified Interest Rates. (Item 15 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt staff recommendation to increase the tax credit for Weldron Silica. (Item 16 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved Form 4507, Application for Commercial Rehabilitation Exemption Certificate. (Item 17 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to accept the field staff report on the City of Grand Rapids reappraisal project and congratulate them on their success. (Item 18 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the Personal Property Examiner Certificates submitted by staff. (Item 19 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Exemptions. (Item 20 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Re-certifications and New Certifications of Computerized Tax Rolls for the following: (Item 21 on agenda)

These certifications will expire on **May 1, 2011**.

Jackson County

Columbia Township

Midland County

City of Midland

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the MCL 211.154 **Concurrences**. (Item 22 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the MCL 211.154 **Special Items Agenda**. (Item 23 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to **postpone** the following MCL 211.154 petitions pending the **Michigan Tax Tribunal Decision**. (Item 24 on agenda)

Pittsfield Township, Washtenaw County

154-08-0327; WARDE MEDICAL LAB; L-99-30-086-170; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2006 AV from \$ 702,800 to \$ 2,617,900 TV from \$ 708,800 to \$ 2,617,900

2007 AV from \$ 913,500 to \$ 2,553,900 TV from \$ 913,500 to \$ 2,553,900

2008 AV from \$ 1,821,100 to \$ 2,233,100 TV from \$ 1,821,100 to \$ 2,233,100

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to **postpone** the following MCL 211.154 petitions until **September 16, 2008**. (Item 24 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to **postpone** the following MCL 211.154 petitions until **October 14, 2008**. (Item 24 on agenda)

City of Warren, Macomb County

154-07-3004; SUPER STEEL TREATING CO.; 99-04-514-800; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2005 AV from \$ 3,705,610 to \$ 2,779,200 TV from \$ 3,705,610 to \$ 2,779,200

154-07-3005; SUPER STEEL TREATING CO.; 98-82-099-417; PERSONAL-IFT PROPERTY

2005 AV from \$ 673,102 to \$ 504,827 TV from \$ 673,102 to \$ 504,827

154-07-3006; SUPER STEEL TREATING CO.; 98-82-099-418; PERSONAL-ift PROPERTY

2005 AV from \$ 886,000 to \$ 504,825 TV from \$ 886,000 to \$ 504,825

City of Southfield, Oakland County

154-08-0312; TOTAL RENAL CARE INC.; 76-99-57-009-470; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2007 AV from \$ 609,450 to \$ 905,050 TV from \$ 609,450 to \$ 905,050

2008 AV from \$ 628,200 to \$ 906,290 TV from \$ 628,200 to \$ 906,290

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to **postpone** the following MCL 211.154 petitions until **October 27, 2008**. (Item 24 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the following MCL 211.154 petitions as **amended**: (Item 24 on agenda)

City of Kalamazoo, Kalamazoo County

154-07-2639; KALAMAZOO METAL RECYCLERS; 9021814; PERSONAL PROPERTY

****This was also a concurrence.**

2005 AV from \$ 21,800 to \$ 770,050 TV from \$ 21,800 to \$ 770,050

2006 AV from \$ 21,500 to \$ 741,700 TV from \$ 21,500 to \$ 741,700

2007 AV from \$ 21,500 to \$ 747,450 TV from \$ 21,500 to \$ 747,450

154-07-2653; TREEHOUSE APARTMENTS; 9012600; PERSONAL PROPERTY

****This was also a concurrence.**

2005 AV from \$ 12,600 to \$ 20,550 TV from \$ 12,600 to \$ 20,550

2006 AV from \$ 12,600 to \$ 19,550 TV from \$ 12,600 to \$ 19,550

2007 AV from \$ 15,000 to \$ 19,700 TV from \$ 15,000 to \$ 19,700

City of Kentwood, Kent County

154-07-2757; ADAC PLASTICS INC.; 41-50-65-024-088; PERSONAL PROPERTY

****This was also a concurrence.**

2005 AV from \$ 709,100 to \$ 1,413,600 TV from \$ 709,100 to \$ 1,413,600

2006 AV from \$ 665,700 to \$ 1,321,600 TV from \$ 665,700 to \$ 1,321,600

2007 AV from \$ 654,000 to \$ 1,313,600 TV from \$ 654,000 to \$ 1,313,600

154-07-2759; ADAC PLASTICS INC.; 41-50-65-009-011; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2005 AV from \$ 944,000 to \$ 1,229,100 TV from \$ 944,000 to \$ 1,229,100

2006 AV from \$ 1,230,100 to \$ 1,725,700 TV from \$ 1,230,100 to \$ 1,725,700

2007 AV from \$ 1,046,600 to \$ 1,546,900 TV from \$ 1,046,600 to \$ 1,546,900

City of Warren, Macomb County

154-07-2693; MSX INTERNATIONAL; 99-01-002-200; PERSONAL PROPERTY

****This was also a concurrence.**

2005 AV from \$ 125,843 to \$ 178,000 TV from \$ 125,843 to \$ 178,000

2006 AV from \$ 373,530 to \$ 285,650 TV from \$ 373,530 to \$ 285,650

2007 AV from \$ 523,226 to \$ 597,450 TV from \$ 523,226 to \$ 597,450

City of Southfield, Oakland County

154-07-2410; LAKELAND NEURO CARE CTR.; 76-99-72-010-050; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2005 AV from \$ 370,960 to \$ 524,590 TV from \$ 370,960 to \$ 524,590

2006 AV from \$ 582,760 to \$ 518,860 TV from \$ 582,760 to \$ 518,860

2007 AV from \$ 546,160 to \$ 496,190 TV from \$ 546,160 to \$ 496,190

154-08-0398; AT & T CAPITAL SERVICES; 76-99-79-027-250; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2006 AV from \$ 657,890 to \$ 718,300 TV from \$ 657,890 to \$ 718,300

2007 AV from \$ 479,730 to \$ 377,300 TV from \$ 479,730 to \$ 377,300

City of Troy, Oakland County

154-07-2302; ENTERTAINMENT PUBLICATIONS; 88-99-00-036-603; Personal Property

2005 AV from \$ 1,433,620 to \$ 1,695,450 TV from \$ 1,433,620 to \$ 1,695,450

2006 AV from \$ 1,687,750 to \$ 1,831,400 TV from \$ 1,687,750 to \$ 1,831,400

2007 AV from \$ 1,474,320 to \$ 1,584,650 TV from \$ 1,474,320 to \$ 1,584,650

Plymouth Township, Wayne County

154-07-2822; ST. JOHN'S GOLF CLUB INC.; P-78-999-00-1266-103; PERSONAL PROPERTY

****This was also a concurrence.**

2005 AV from \$ 546,630 to \$ 566,800 TV from \$ 546,630 to \$ 566,800

2006 AV from \$ 542,010 to \$ 547,700 TV from \$ 542,010 to \$ 547,700

2007 AV from \$ 564,780 to \$ 569,600 TV from \$ 564,780 to \$ 569,600

154-07-2824; US FARATHANE CORPORATION; P-78-999-00-2005-070; Personal Property

2005 AV from \$ 404,870 to \$ 456,450 TV from \$ 404,870 to \$ 456,450

2006 AV from \$ 391,540 to \$ 458,300 TV from \$ 391,540 to \$ 458,300

2007 AV from \$ 386,690 to \$ 448,450 TV from \$ 386,690 to \$ 448,450

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to **deny** the following MCL 211.154 petitions: (Item 24 on agenda)

City of Grand Rapids, Kent County

154-08-0394; UNITED AIR LINES INC.; 41-03-74-820-500; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2008 AV from \$ 366,000 to \$ 271,042 TV from \$ 366,000 to \$ 271,042

City of Walker, Kent County

154-07-2959; LASALLE SYSTEMS LEASING; 41-50-86-022-538; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2007 AV from \$ 1,238,250 to \$ 0 TV from \$ 1,238,250 to \$ 0

West Bloomfield Township, Oakland County

154-08-0302; ALLERION ASSOCIATES; X-99-00-001-113; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2007 AV from \$ 362,240 to \$ 672,240 TV from \$ 362,240 to \$ 672,240

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to allow the **withdrawal** of the following MCL 211.154 petitions: (Item 24 on agenda)

City of East Lansing, Ingham County

154-07-2517; ROCKETSPORTS; 33-20-90-52-705-000; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2005 AV from \$ 600,000 to \$ 897,000 TV from \$ 600,000 to \$ 867,000

2006 AV from \$ 700,000 to \$ 782,000 TV from \$ 700,000 to \$ 782,000

2007 AV from \$ 600,000 to \$ 965,900 TV from \$ 600,000 to \$ 965,900

City of Warren, Macomb County

154-07-2701; NU ERA SHEET METAL CO.; 99-05-574-602; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2005 AV from \$ 317,970 to \$ 428,500 TV from \$ 317,970 to \$ 428,500

2006 AV from \$ 394,053 to \$ 409,800 TV from \$ 394,053 to \$ 409,800

2007 AV from \$ 440,664 to \$ 456,350 TV from \$ 440,664 to \$ 456,350

154-07-2950; CONTINENTAL TAYLOR LLC; 60-090-01-0565-313; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2005 AV from \$ 3,166,600 to \$ 725,000 TV from \$ 3,166,600 to \$ 725,000

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt all other MCL 211.154 petitions **as submitted:** (Item 24 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved the following MCL 211.154 petitions as **concurrences.** These petitions were initially noticed as non concurrences. (Item 24 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

The Commission accepted Executive Secretary Sobel's proposed meeting schedule for 2009.

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Roberts to cancel the November 18th meeting and add a meeting on October 27, 2008.

The Commission accepted Executive Secretary Sobel's recommendation to hold a public hearing for the proposed rule changes of the State Tax Commission on September 23, 2008.

The Commission accepted Executive Secretary Sobel's recommendation to review the State Tax Commission Ethics Policies and Procedures.

The Commission asked the 14 Point Review Committee to work on a recommendation on how to provide information to local units on the 14-Point Review scoring without releasing the actual score.

The Commission received the decision on the Supreme Court case involving Daimler Chrysler, Ford Motor Company and Detroit Diesel v State Tax Commission. The Supreme Court had ruled in favor of the State Tax Commission.

The Commission discussed concerns related to the reappraisal effort of Montcalm Township, Montcalm County and asked that the Township provide monthly reports regarding their progress. The Commission also directed field staff to conduct reviews to determine the adequacy. Should the Township fail to file the required reports they will be ordered to appear at a future meeting.

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, to go into closed session to discuss matter of pending litigation with all members present. Roll Call Vote: Chairperson Naftaly – Yes, Commissioner Roberts – Yes, Commissioner Morgan – Yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to return to open session. Roll Call Vote: Chairperson Naftaly – Yes, Commissioners Roberts – Yes, Commissioner Morgan – Yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adjourn the meeting of the State Tax Commission at 1:00 P.M.

DATED TYPED: **August 20, 2008**

DATE APPROVED: **September 16, 2008**

Robert H. Naftaly, Chair
State Tax Commission

Douglas B. Roberts, Member
State Tax Commission

Frederick W. Morgan, Member
State Tax Commission